

# Controlled invariance for DAEs

Thomas Berger

Fachbereich Mathematik, Universität Hamburg

Lecce, March 26, 2015

# Linear systems

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}Ex(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t)} \quad (E, A, B)$$

$$E, A \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times n}, B \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}$$

$$\mathfrak{B} = \{ (x, u) \in C^1 \times C \mid E\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t) \}$$

**Def.:**  $\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  is controlled invariant  $:\Leftrightarrow$

$$\forall x^0 \in \mathcal{V} \exists (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \forall t \geq 0 : x(0) = x^0 \wedge x(t) \in \mathcal{V}$$

# Linear systems

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}Ex(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t)} \quad (E, A, B)$$

$$E, A \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times n}, B \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}$$

$$\mathfrak{B} = \{ (x, u) \in C^1 \times C \mid E\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t) + Bu(t) \}$$

**Def.:**  $\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  is controlled invariant  $:\Leftrightarrow$

$$\forall x^0 \in \mathcal{V} \exists (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \forall t \geq 0 : x(0) = x^0 \wedge x(t) \in \mathcal{V}$$

## Theorem (controlled invariance)

The following is equivalent for  $(E, A, B)$  and  $\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ :

- (1)  $\mathcal{V}$  is controlled invariant
- (2)  $A\mathcal{V} \subseteq E\mathcal{V} + \text{im } B$
- (3)  $\exists F \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n} : (A + BF)\mathcal{V} \subseteq E\mathcal{V}$

**Proof:** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2):

$$x^0 \in \mathcal{V} \Rightarrow Ax^0 = Ax(0) = E\dot{x}(0) - Bu(0) \in E\mathcal{V} + \text{im } B$$

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3):

$$\text{im } V = \mathcal{V}, AV = EVW + BU \quad \Rightarrow \quad F := -U(V^\top V)^{-1}V^\top$$

## Theorem (controlled invariance)

The following is equivalent for  $(E, A, B)$  and  $\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ :

- (1)  $\mathcal{V}$  is controlled invariant
- (2)  $A\mathcal{V} \subseteq E\mathcal{V} + \text{im } B$
- (3)  $\exists F \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n} : (A + BF)\mathcal{V} \subseteq E\mathcal{V}$

**Proof:** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2):

$$x^0 \in \mathcal{V} \Rightarrow Ax^0 = Ax(0) = E\dot{x}(0) - Bu(0) \in E\mathcal{V} + \text{im } B$$

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3):

$$\text{im } V = \mathcal{V}, AV = EVW + BU \quad \Rightarrow \quad F := -U(V^\top V)^{-1}V^\top$$

**Existence lemma:**  $E, A \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times n}$  such that  $\text{im } A \subseteq \text{im } E$ , then

$$\forall x^0 \in \mathbb{R}^n \exists x \in C^\infty \forall t \in \mathbb{R} : x(0) = x^0 \wedge E\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t)$$

(3) $\Rightarrow$ (1):

$$x^0 = Vw^0 \in \mathcal{V}, \quad \text{im}(A + BF)V \subseteq \text{im } EV$$

$$\stackrel{\text{lemma}}{\implies} \exists w \in C^\infty : w(0) = w^0 \wedge EV\dot{w}(t) = (A + BF)Vw(t),$$

$$\implies x := Vw, \quad u := FVw \text{ satisfy}$$

$$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}, \quad x(0) = x^0 \text{ and } x(t) \in \mathcal{V}, \quad t \geq 0 \quad \square$$

**Existence lemma:**  $E, A \in \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times n}$  such that  $\text{im } A \subseteq \text{im } E$ , then

$$\forall x^0 \in \mathbb{R}^n \exists x \in C^\infty \forall t \in \mathbb{R} : x(0) = x^0 \wedge E\dot{x}(t) = Ax(t)$$

(3) $\Rightarrow$ (1):

$$x^0 = Vw^0 \in \mathcal{V}, \quad \text{im}(A + BF)V \subseteq \text{im } EV$$

$$\stackrel{\text{lemma}}{\implies} \exists w \in C^\infty : w(0) = w^0 \wedge EV\dot{w}(t) = (A + BF)Vw(t),$$

$$\implies x := Vw, \quad u := FVw \text{ satisfy}$$

$$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}, \quad x(0) = x^0 \text{ and } x(t) \in \mathcal{V}, \quad t \geq 0 \quad \square$$

## Nonlinear systems

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}E(x(t)) = f(x(t)) + g(x(t))u(t)} \quad (E, f, g)$$

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  open,  $0 \in X$ ,  $E, f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell$ ,  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}$  diff.,  $f(0) = 0$

$\mathfrak{B} = \{ (x, u) \in C^1 \times C \mid (x, u) \text{ is a maximal solution of } (E, f, g) \}$

$M$  – connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$

**Def.:**  $M$  is locally controlled invariant : $\iff$

$\exists$  open neighborhood  $U$  of  $0 \in X$  such that

$\forall x^0 \in M \cap U \exists (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \exists t_0 \in \text{dom } x, x(t_0) = x^0 :$

$(\forall t \in \text{dom } x, t \geq t_0 : x(t) \in M \cap U)$

$\vee (\exists \hat{t} \in \text{dom } x, \hat{t} > t_0 \forall t \in [t_0, \hat{t}) : x(t) \in M \cap U \wedge x(\hat{t}) \in \partial(M \cap U))$



## Nonlinear systems

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}E(x(t)) = f(x(t)) + g(x(t))u(t)} \quad (E, f, g)$$

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  open,  $0 \in X$ ,  $E, f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell$ ,  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}$  diff.,  $f(0) = 0$

$\mathfrak{B} = \{ (x, u) \in C^1 \times C \mid (x, u) \text{ is a maximal solution of } (E, f, g) \}$

$M$  – connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$

**Def.:**  $M$  is locally controlled invariant  $:\iff$

$\exists$  open neighborhood  $U$  of  $0 \in X$  such that

$\forall x^0 \in M \cap U \exists (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \exists t_0 \in \text{dom } x, x(t_0) = x^0 :$

$(\forall t \in \text{dom } x, t \geq t_0 : x(t) \in M \cap U)$

$\vee (\exists \hat{t} \in \text{dom } x, \hat{t} > t_0 \forall t \in [t_0, \hat{t}) : x(t) \in M \cap U \wedge x(\hat{t}) \in \partial(M \cap U))$

## Theorem (local controlled invariance)

$E \in \mathcal{C}^2$ ,  $f, g \in \mathcal{C}^1$ ,  $M$  connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$  such that, in a neighborhood of  $0 \in M$ ,

$$\dim E'(x)T_x M = \text{const} \quad \wedge \quad \dim (E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)) = \text{const}$$

Then the following is equivalent:

- (1)  $M$  is locally controlled invariant.
- (2)  $f(x) \in E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)$  in  $M \cap U$ .
- (3)  $\exists u \in \mathcal{C}^1(M \cap U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m) : f(x) + g(x)u(x) \in E'(x)T_x M$  in  $M \cap U$ .

**Proof:** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2):  $x^0 \in M \cap U$

$$\Rightarrow f(x^0) = E'(x(0))\dot{x}(0) - g(x(0))u(0) \in E'(x^0)T_{x^0} M + \text{im } g(x^0)$$

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3): technical, but not difficult

## Theorem (local controlled invariance)

$E \in \mathcal{C}^2$ ,  $f, g \in \mathcal{C}^1$ ,  $M$  connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$  such that, in a neighborhood of  $0 \in M$ ,

$$\dim E'(x)T_x M = \text{const} \quad \wedge \quad \dim (E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)) = \text{const}$$

Then the following is equivalent:

- (1)  $M$  is locally controlled invariant.
- (2)  $f(x) \in E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)$  in  $M \cap U$ .
- (3)  $\exists u \in \mathcal{C}^1(M \cap U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m) : f(x) + g(x)u(x) \in E'(x)T_x M$  in  $M \cap U$ .

**Proof:** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2):  $x^0 \in M \cap U$

$$\Rightarrow f(x^0) = E'(x(0))\dot{x}(0) - g(x(0))u(0) \in E'(x^0)T_{x^0} M + \text{im } g(x^0)$$

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3): technical, but not difficult

## Theorem (local controlled invariance)

$E \in \mathcal{C}^2$ ,  $f, g \in \mathcal{C}^1$ ,  $M$  connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$  such that, in a neighborhood of  $0 \in M$ ,

$$\dim E'(x)T_x M = \text{const} \quad \wedge \quad \dim (E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)) = \text{const}$$

Then the following is equivalent:

- (1)  $M$  is locally controlled invariant.
- (2)  $f(x) \in E'(x)T_x M + \text{im } g(x)$  in  $M \cap U$ .
- (3)  $\exists u \in \mathcal{C}^1(M \cap U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m) : f(x) + g(x)u(x) \in E'(x)T_x M$  in  $M \cap U$ .

**Proof:** (1) $\Rightarrow$ (2):  $x^0 \in M \cap U$

$$\Rightarrow f(x^0) = E'(x(0))\dot{x}(0) - g(x(0))u(0) \in E'(x^0)T_{x^0} M + \text{im } g(x^0)$$

(2) $\Rightarrow$ (3): technical, but not difficult

**Existence lemma:**  $U \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  open,  $E, f : U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell$  diff. and

$$\forall x \in U : \text{rk } E'(x) = r \quad \wedge \quad f(x) \in E'(x)T_x U,$$

$$\implies \forall x^0 \in U \exists x \in C^1(I \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n) \forall t \in I : x(0) = x^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} E(x(t)) = f(x(t))$$

(3) $\implies$ (1):  $x^0 = \psi(w^0) \in M \cap U$ ,  $\psi : G \rightarrow M \cap U$  parametrization of  $M$

$$\text{def. } \tilde{E} := E \circ \psi, \quad \tilde{f} := f \circ \psi + (g \circ \psi)(u \circ \psi)$$

$$\implies \text{rk } \tilde{E}'(x) = \text{rk } E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x) = \dim E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = \text{const},$$

$$\tilde{f}(x) \in E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x)T_x G = \tilde{E}'(x)T_x G$$

$$\stackrel{\text{lemma}}{\implies} \exists w \in C^1(I \rightarrow G) : w(0) = w^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{E}(w(t)) = \tilde{f}(w(t)),$$

$$\implies (x := \psi \circ w, u \circ w) \in \mathfrak{B}, \quad x(0) = x^0$$

$$\text{and } x(t) \in M \cap U, \quad \forall t \in I, t \geq 0$$

Remains: show that  $(x, u \circ x)$  can be extended to a maximal sln.

$\rightarrow$  Zorn's Lemma □

**Existence lemma:**  $U \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  open,  $E, f : U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell$  diff. and

$$\forall x \in U : \text{rk } E'(x) = r \quad \wedge \quad f(x) \in E'(x)T_x U,$$

$$\implies \forall x^0 \in U \exists x \in C^1(I \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n) \forall t \in I : x(0) = x^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} E(x(t)) = f(x(t))$$

(3) $\implies$ (1):  $x^0 = \psi(w^0) \in M \cap U$ ,  $\psi : G \rightarrow M \cap U$  parametrization of  $M$

def.  $\tilde{E} := E \circ \psi$ ,  $\tilde{f} := f \circ \psi + (g \circ \psi)(u \circ \psi)$

$$\implies \text{rk } \tilde{E}'(x) = \text{rk } E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x) = \dim E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = \text{const},$$

$$\tilde{f}(x) \in E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x)T_x G = \tilde{E}'(x)T_x G$$

$$\stackrel{\text{lemma}}{\implies} \exists w \in C^1(I \rightarrow G) : w(0) = w^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{E}(w(t)) = \tilde{f}(w(t)),$$

$$\implies (x := \psi \circ w, u \circ w) \in \mathfrak{B}, x(0) = x^0$$

and  $x(t) \in M \cap U, \forall t \in I, t \geq 0$

Remains: show that  $(x, u \circ x)$  can be extended to a maximal sln.

$\rightarrow$  Zorn's Lemma



**Existence lemma:**  $U \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$  open,  $E, f : U \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell$  diff. and

$$\forall x \in U : \text{rk } E'(x) = r \quad \wedge \quad f(x) \in E'(x)T_x U,$$

$$\implies \forall x^0 \in U \exists x \in C^1(I \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n) \forall t \in I : x(0) = x^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} E(x(t)) = f(x(t))$$

(3) $\implies$ (1):  $x^0 = \psi(w^0) \in M \cap U$ ,  $\psi : G \rightarrow M \cap U$  parametrization of  $M$

def.  $\tilde{E} := E \circ \psi$ ,  $\tilde{f} := f \circ \psi + (g \circ \psi)(u \circ \psi)$

$$\implies \text{rk } \tilde{E}'(x) = \text{rk } E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x) = \dim E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = \text{const},$$

$$\tilde{f}(x) \in E'(\psi(x))T_{\psi(x)}M = E'(\psi(x))\psi'(x)T_x G = \tilde{E}'(x)T_x G$$

$$\stackrel{\text{lemma}}{\implies} \exists w \in C^1(I \rightarrow G) : w(0) = w^0 \wedge \frac{d}{dt} \tilde{E}(w(t)) = \tilde{f}(w(t)),$$

$$\implies (x := \psi \circ w, u \circ w) \in \mathfrak{B}, x(0) = x^0$$

and  $x(t) \in M \cap U, \forall t \in I, t \geq 0$

Remains: show that  $(x, u \circ x)$  can be extended to a maximal sln.

$\rightarrow$  Zorn's Lemma



## Zero dynamics

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}E(x(t)) = f(x(t)) + g(x(t))u(t), \quad y(t) = h(x(t))} \quad (E, f, g, h)$$

$E, f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell, g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}, h : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^p$  diff.,  $f(0) = 0, h(0) = 0$

Zero dynamics:

$$\mathcal{ZD} = \{ (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \mid y(t) = h(x(t)) = 0 \}$$

$M$  – connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$

**Def.:**  $M$  is output zeroing  $:\Leftrightarrow$

$M$  is locally controlled invariant and  $M \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$



## Zero dynamics

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}E(x(t)) = f(x(t)) + g(x(t))u(t), \quad y(t) = h(x(t))} \quad (E, f, g, h)$$

$E, f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell, g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}, h : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^p$  diff.,  $f(0) = 0, h(0) = 0$

### Zero dynamics:

$$\mathcal{ZD} = \{ (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \mid y(t) = h(x(t)) = 0 \}$$

$M$  – connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$

**Def.:**  $M$  is output zeroing  $:\Leftrightarrow$

$M$  is locally controlled invariant and  $M \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$

## Zero dynamics

$$\boxed{\frac{d}{dt}E(x(t)) = f(x(t)) + g(x(t))u(t), \quad y(t) = h(x(t))} \quad (E, f, g, h)$$

$E, f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^\ell, g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\ell \times m}, h : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^p$  diff.,  $f(0) = 0, h(0) = 0$

**Zero dynamics:**

$$\mathcal{ZD} = \{ (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B} \mid y(t) = h(x(t)) = 0 \}$$

$M$  – connected submanifold of  $X$  with  $0 \in M$

**Def.:**  $M$  is output zeroing  $:\iff$

$M$  is locally controlled invariant and  $M \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$

## Example

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$x^0 = (x_1^0, x_2^0)^\top \in M \Rightarrow x(t) := x^0, u(t) := -x_1^0, t \in \mathbb{R}$ , satisfy

$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}$  and  $x(0) = x^0, x(t) \in M$  for  $t \in \mathbb{R}$

$\Rightarrow M$  is output zeroing submanifold

**Note:**  $u$  must satisfy the algebraic constraint  $u = -x_1$

## Example

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$x^0 = (x_1^0, x_2^0)^\top \in M \Rightarrow x(t) := x^0, u(t) := -x_1^0, t \in \mathbb{R}$ , satisfy

$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}$  and  $x(0) = x^0, x(t) \in M$  for  $t \in \mathbb{R}$

$\Rightarrow M$  is output zeroing submanifold

**Note:**  $u$  must satisfy the algebraic constraint  $u = -x_1$

## Example

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$x^0 = (x_1^0, x_2^0)^\top \in M \Rightarrow x(t) := x^0, u(t) := -x_1^0, t \in \mathbb{R}$ , satisfy

$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}$  and  $x(0) = x^0, x(t) \in M$  for  $t \in \mathbb{R}$

$\Rightarrow M$  is output zeroing submanifold

**Note:**  $u$  must satisfy the algebraic constraint  $u = -x_1$

## Example

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$x^0 = (x_1^0, x_2^0)^\top \in M \Rightarrow x(t) := x^0, u(t) := -x_1^0, t \in \mathbb{R}$ , satisfy

$(x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}$  and  $x(0) = x^0, x(t) \in M$  for  $t \in \mathbb{R}$

$\implies M$  is output zeroing submanifold

**Note:**  $u$  must satisfy the algebraic constraint  $u = -x_1$

## Theorem (zero dynamics algorithm)

$E, f, g, h \in C^\infty$ ; def.  $M_0 := h^{-1}(0)$  and

$$M_k := \{ x \in M_{k-1} \mid f(x) \in E'(x)T_x M_{k-1} + \text{im } g(x) \};$$

suppose that  $M_k$  is a connected submanifold with  $0 \in M_k$

- (1)  $\exists k^* \in \mathbb{N}_0 \forall j \in \mathbb{N} : M_0 \supsetneq M_1 \supsetneq \dots \supsetneq M_{k^*} =: Z^* = M_{k^*+j}$
- (2)  $\dim E'(x)T_x Z^* = \text{const}$   
 $\wedge \dim (E'(x)T_x Z^* + \text{im } g(x)) = \text{const}$  in  $Z^* \cap U$ ,  
 $\implies Z^*$  is a **locally maximal** output zeroing submanifold
- (3)  $\exists$  open neighborhood  $U$  of  $0 \in X \forall$  open  $O \subseteq U \forall (x, u) \in \mathfrak{B}$   
 with  $x(t) \in O, t \in \text{dom } x$ :

$$(x, u) \in \mathcal{ZD} \iff x(t) \in Z^* \cap O \quad \forall t \in \text{dom } x.$$

## Example revisited

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$$M = M_0 = M_1 = Z^*$$

$\implies$   $M$  is locally maximal output zeroing submanifold

**BUT!**

$$\dim E'(x)T_x Z^* = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{and } \dim (E'(x)T_x Z^* + \operatorname{im} g(x)) = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$



## Example revisited

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$$M = M_0 = M_1 = Z^*$$

$\implies$   $M$  is locally maximal output zeroing submanifold

**BUT!**

$$\dim E'(x)T_x Z^* = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{and } \dim (E'(x)T_x Z^* + \operatorname{im} g(x)) = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

## Example revisited

$$\begin{aligned}
 \dot{x}_1 &= 0 \\
 0 &= x_1 + u \\
 y &= x_1 - x_2^2
 \end{aligned}
 \quad M := \{ x \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = x_2^2 \} \subseteq h^{-1}(0)$$

$$M = M_0 = M_1 = Z^*$$

$\implies M$  is locally maximal output zeroing submanifold

**BUT!**

$$\dim E'(x)T_x Z^* = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{and } \dim (E'(x)T_x Z^* + \operatorname{im} g(x)) = \dim \operatorname{im} \begin{bmatrix} 2x_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$